

# Exhibit A



## M E M O

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: June 10, 2022

Project Number: 22065

Regarding: Avon Parks 2022 Asphalt Paving Program  
Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on June 9, 2022 for the Avon Parks 2022 Asphalt Paving Program. A total of five (5) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon – City Hall. Base Bids ranged from a low bid of \$251,481.50 to a high bid of \$299,992.00. Alternate Bids ranged from a low bid of \$267,509.00 to a high bid of \$769,275.00.

The Engineers Estimate for the project was \$300,075.00. The low bid of \$251,481.50 as received from Cunningham Paving Company is approximately 16.2% below the Engineers Estimate for the project.

### Summary of Bid Totals

Contractor	Base Bid Total	Alternate Bid Total
Cunningham Paving Company	\$251,481.50	\$267,509.00
Ohio Paving & Construction	\$263,317.75	No Bid Submitted
Crossroads Asphalt Recycling	\$277,625.00	\$769,275.00
Precision Paving	\$279,865.00	No Bid Submitted
Barbicas Construction	\$284,844.50	\$299,992.00

The bid as submitted by Cunningham Paving Company has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Cunningham Paving Company is the lowest and best bid for the Avon Parks 2022 Asphalt Paving Program.

Cc: Duane Streator, City of Avon, Service Director  
Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director  
John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director

**BID TABULATION**  
**AVON PARKS 2022 ASPHALT PAVING PROGRAM**

City of Avon

DATE: June 9, 2022

CVE JOB NO. 22065 Engineer's Estimate **\$300,075.00**

				CUNNINGHAM PAVING COMPANY		OHIO PAVING & CONSTRUCTION	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	EXCAVATION AND EMBANKMENT OF EXISTING AGGREGATE BASE	SY	6,750	\$5.65	\$38,137.50	\$5.06	\$34,155.00
2	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	6,750	\$0.50	\$3,375.00	\$0.60	\$4,050.00
3	LINEAR GRADING, SEEDING AND MULCHING	LF	680	\$8.50	\$5,780.00	\$13.30	\$9,044.00
4	TACK COAT, TRACKLESS TACK FOR SURFACE COURSE (0.05 GAL/SY)	GAL	340	\$4.50	\$1,530.00	\$5.50	\$1,870.00
5	ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	285	\$245.00	\$69,825.00	\$254.75	\$72,603.75
6	ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	470	\$214.00	\$100,580.00	\$222.00	\$104,340.00
7	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$100.00	\$100.00	\$2,085.00	\$2,085.00
8	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$2,514.00	\$2,514.00	\$3,550.00	\$3,550.00
9	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNING	LUMP	1	\$2,640.00	\$2,640.00	\$4,620.00	\$4,620.00
10	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$25,000.00		\$25,000.00
11	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00
<b>TOTAL BASE BID</b>				BASE BID TOTAL	<b>\$251,481.50</b>	BASE BID TOTAL	<b>\$263,317.75</b>
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 14-28 DAYS		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 30 DAYS	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 07/15/2022		EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 08/01/2022	
A1	NIGHT WORK-EXCAVATION AND EMBANKMENT OF EXISTING AGGREGATE BASE	SY	6,750	\$6.10	\$41,175.00		\$0.00
A2	NIGHT WORK- SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	6,750	\$0.75	\$5,062.50		\$0.00
A3	NIGHT WORK- LINEAR GRADING, SEEDING AND MULCHING	LF	680	\$10.50	\$7,140.00		\$0.00
A4	NIGHT WORK- TACK COAT, TRACKLESS TACK FOR SURFACE COURSE (0.05 GAL/SY)	GAL	340	\$4.50	\$1,530.00		\$0.00
A5	NIGHT WORK- ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	285	\$256.50	\$73,102.50		\$0.00
A6	NIGHT WORK- ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	470	\$225.50	\$105,985.00		\$0.00
A7	NIGHT WORK- MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$1,000.00	\$1,000.00		\$0.00
A8	NIGHT WORK- MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$2,674.00	\$2,674.00		\$0.00
A9	NIGHT WORK- PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNING	LUMP	1	\$2,840.00	\$2,840.00		\$0.00
A10	NIGHT WORK- GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$25,000.00		\$0.00
A11	NIGHT WORK- CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$2,000.00		\$0.00
<b>TOTAL ALTERNATE BID</b>				ALTERNATE BID TOTAL	<b>\$267,509.00</b>	ALTERNATE BID TOTAL	<b>\$0.00</b>
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 14-28 DAYS		DAYS TO COMPLETE:	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 07/15/2022		EARLIEST STARTING DATE:	

**BID TABULATION**  
**AVON PARKS 2022 ASPHALT PAVING PROGRAM**  
**City of Avon**

**DATE: June 9, 2022**

**CVE JOB NO. 22065 Engineer's Estimate \$300,075.00**

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	CROSSROADS ASPHALT RECYCLING		PRECISION PAVING INC	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	EXCAVATION AND EMBANKMENT OF EXISTING AGGREGATE BASE	SY	6,750	\$5.00	\$33,750.00	\$4.00	\$27,000.00
2	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	6,750	\$1.00	\$6,750.00	\$1.00	\$6,750.00
3	LINEAR GRADING, SEEDING AND MULCHING	LF	680	\$12.50	\$8,500.00	\$7.00	\$4,760.00
4	TACK COAT, TRACKLESS TACK FOR SURFACE COURSE (0.05 GAL/SY)	GAL	340	\$5.00	\$1,700.00	\$3.00	\$1,020.00
5	ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	285	\$255.00	\$72,675.00	\$283.00	\$80,655.00
6	ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	470	\$235.00	\$110,450.00	\$244.00	\$114,680.00
7	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$3,000.00	\$3,000.00
8	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$7,000.00	\$7,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
9	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNING	LUMP	1	\$4,800.00	\$4,800.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00
10	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$25,000.00		\$25,000.00
11	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$2,000.00		\$2,000.00
<b>TOTAL BASE BID</b>					<b>BASE BID TOTAL \$277,625.00</b>	<b>BASE BID TOTAL \$279,865.00</b>	
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 30 DAYS		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 15 DAYS	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 08/01/2022		EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 09/06/2022	
A1	NIGHT WORK-EXCAVATION AND EMBANKMENT OF EXISTING AGGREGATE BASE	SY	6,750	\$15.00	\$101,250.00		\$0.00
A2	NIGHT WORK- SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	6,750	\$3.00	\$20,250.00		\$0.00
A3	NIGHT WORK- LINEAR GRADING, SEEDING AND MULCHING	LF	680	\$37.50	\$25,500.00		\$0.00
A4	NIGHT WORK- TACK COAT, TRACKLESS TACK FOR SURFACE COURSE (0.05 GAL/SY)	GAL	340	\$15.00	\$5,100.00		\$0.00
A5	NIGHT WORK- ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	285	\$765.00	\$218,025.00		\$0.00
A6	NIGHT WORK- ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	470	\$705.00	\$331,350.00		\$0.00
A7	NIGHT WORK- MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00		\$0.00
A8	NIGHT WORK- MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$21,000.00	\$21,000.00		\$0.00
A9	NIGHT WORK- PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNING	LUMP	1	\$4,800.00	\$4,800.00		\$0.00
A10	NIGHT WORK- GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$25,000.00		\$0.00
A11	NIGHT WORK- CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$2,000.00		\$0.00
<b>TOTAL ALTERNATE BID</b>					<b>ALTERNATE BID TOTAL \$769,275.00</b>	<b>ALTERNATE BID TOTAL \$0.00</b>	
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 DAYS		DAYS TO COMPLETE:	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 08/01/2022			

**BID TABULATION**  
**AVON PARKS 2022 ASPHALT PAVING PROGRAM**  
**City of Avon**

**DATE: June 9, 2022**

**CVE JOB NO. 22065 Engineer's Estimate \$300,075.00**

				<b>BARBICAS PAVING LLC</b>	
<b>ITEM</b>	<b>DESCRIPTION</b>	<b>UNIT</b>	<b>QTY.</b>	<b>UNIT PRICE</b>	<b>TOTAL PRICE</b>
1	EXCAVATION AND EMBANKMENT OF EXISTING AGGREGATE BASE	SY	6,750	\$4.50	\$30,375.00
2	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	6,750	\$0.25	\$1,687.50
3	LINEAR GRADING, SEEDING AND MULCHING	LF	680	\$10.50	\$7,140.00
4	TACK COAT, TRACKLESS TACK FOR SURFACE COURSE (0.05 GAL/SY)	GAL	340	\$5.30	\$1,802.00
5	ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	285	\$302.00	\$86,070.00
6	ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	470	\$241.00	\$113,270.00
7	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
8	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00
9	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNING	LUMP	1	\$5,500.00	\$5,500.00
10	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$25,000.00
11	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$2,000.00
<b>TOTAL BASE BID</b>				BASE BID TOTAL	<b>\$284,844.50</b>
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 30 DAYS	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 08/08/2022	
A1	NIGHT WORK-EXCAVATION AND EMBANKMENT OF EXISTING AGGREGATE BASE	SY	6,750	\$4.80	\$32,400.00
A2	NIGHT WORK- SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	6,750	\$0.30	\$2,025.00
A3	NIGHT WORK- LINEAR GRADING, SEEDING AND MULCHING	LF	680	\$10.50	\$7,140.00
A4	NIGHT WORK- TACK COAT, TRACKLESS TACK FOR SURFACE COURSE (0.05 GAL/SY)	GAL	340	\$5.30	\$1,802.00
A5	NIGHT WORK- ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	285	\$325.00	\$92,625.00
A6	NIGHT WORK- ODOT 441 ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	470	\$250.00	\$117,500.00
A7	NIGHT WORK- MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
A8	NIGHT WORK- MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$11,500.00	\$11,500.00
A9	NIGHT WORK- PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNING	LUMP	1	\$6,000.00	\$6,000.00
A10	NIGHT WORK- GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$25,000.00
A11	NIGHT WORK- CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1		\$2,000.00
<b>TOTAL ALTERNATE BID</b>				ALTERNATE BID TOTAL	<b>\$299,992.00</b>
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 30 DAYS	
				EARLIEST STARTING DATE: 08/08/2022	

# BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

## Avon Parks 2022 Asphalt Paving Program

(5 Bidders)

Bid Opening Date – June 9, 2022

Avon, Ohio

<b>Bid Components</b>	<b>Cunningham Paving Company</b>	<b>Ohio Paving &amp; Construction</b>	<b>Crossroads Asphalt Recycling</b>	<b>Precision Paving</b>	<b>Barbicas Construction</b>
<b>Proposal - Completed and Signed</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid</b>	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond
<b>Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
<b>Verification of Bid Total</b>	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes