



M E M O

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: June 19, 2020

Project Number: 17325

Regarding: French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project – Phase 1
Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on June 18, 2020 for the French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project – Phase 1. A total of (6) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon – City Hall. Bids ranged from a low bid of \$559,289.52 to a high bid of \$634,998.00.

The Engineers Estimate for the project was \$628,680. The low bid of \$559,289.52 as received from Barbicas Construction Company, Inc. is approximately 11% below the Engineers Estimate for the project.

Summary of Bid Totals

Contractor	Bid Total
Barbicas Construction Company, Inc.	\$559,289.52
Ronyak Paving	\$565,565.00
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$587,579.00
Erie Blacktop, Inc.	\$593,632.00
Karvo Companies	\$613,577.70
Precision Paving, Inc.	\$634,998.00

The bid as submitted by Barbicas Construction Company, Inc. has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Barbicas Construction Company, Inc. is the lowest and best bid for the French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project – Phase 1.

Cc: Michael Farmer, City of Avon, Service Director
Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director
John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director

BID TABULATION**French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project - Phase 1****City of Avon****DATE: June 18, 2020****CVE JOB NO. 17325 Engineer's Estimate \$628,680.00**

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	Barbicas Construction Co., Inc.		Ronyak Paving Inc.	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REMOVED	SY	1,660	\$12.00	\$19,920.00	\$7.00	\$11,620.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	120	\$75.00	\$9,000.00	\$65.00	\$7,800.00
3	CONCRETE WALK REMOVED	SF	158	\$2.50	\$395.00	\$2.00	\$316.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	280	\$20.00	\$5,600.00	\$20.00	\$5,600.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	1,660	\$0.50	\$830.00	\$1.00	\$1,660.00
6	LINEAR GRADING	FT	5,170	\$1.00	\$5,170.00	\$6.50	\$33,605.00
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	929	\$24.00	\$22,296.00	\$26.00	\$24,154.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	929	\$54.00	\$50,166.00	\$45.00	\$41,805.00
9	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	9,290	\$2.00	\$18,580.00	\$2.00	\$18,580.00
10	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE	CY	370	\$140.00	\$51,800.00	\$125.00	\$46,250.00
11	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	280	\$75.00	\$21,000.00	\$60.00	\$16,800.00
12	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1 (448), PG 64-22	CY	325	\$200.00	\$65,000.00	\$160.00	\$52,000.00
13	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448) PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	195	\$200.00	\$39,000.00	\$155.00	\$30,225.00
14	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448) PG 64-22	CY	455	\$150.00	\$68,250.00	\$130.00	\$59,150.00
15	CONCRETE CURB RAMP	SF	100	\$50.00	\$5,000.00	\$15.50	\$1,550.00
16	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$650.00	\$3,250.00	\$700.00	\$3,500.00
17	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$300.00	\$600.00	\$525.00	\$1,050.00
18	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.50	\$1,500.00	\$2.00	\$2,000.00
19	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$30,000.00	\$30,000.00	\$35,804.00	\$35,804.00
20	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,150	\$2.00	\$2,300.00	\$7.00	\$8,050.00
21	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	195	\$75.00	\$14,625.00	\$86.00	\$16,770.00
22	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$400.00	\$400.00	\$550.00	\$550.00
23	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$35,000.00	\$35,000.00
24	SIGNING, MISC.: SOLAR POWERED RECTANGULAR RAPID FLASHING BEACON(RRFB) SIGN ASSEMBLY	EACH	2	\$8,500.00	\$17,000.00	\$8,500.00	\$17,000.00
25	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$3,200.00	\$3,200.00	\$3,200.00	\$3,200.00
26	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$14,350.00	\$14,350.00	\$20,151.00	\$20,151.00
27	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	43	\$210.64	\$9,057.52	\$125.00	\$5,375.00
28	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY	LUMP	1	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00
29	INSPECTION ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00
30	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$559,289.52	TOTAL	\$565,565.00
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60 DAYS	NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 60 DAYS		
				EARLIEST START DATE: 8/1/2020	EARLIEST START DATE: 8/1/2020		

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	Chagrin Valley Paving		Erie Blacktop Inc.	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REMOVED	SY	1,660	\$12.00	\$19,920.00	\$9.50	\$15,770.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	120	\$125.00	\$15,000.00	\$90.00	\$10,800.00
3	CONCRETE WALK REMOVED	SF	158	\$3.00	\$474.00	\$11.50	\$1,817.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	280	\$7.00	\$1,960.00	\$40.00	\$11,200.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	1,660	\$0.25	\$415.00	\$0.80	\$1,328.00
6	LINEAR GRADING	FT	5,170	\$1.00	\$5,170.00	\$4.90	\$25,333.00
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	929	\$20.00	\$18,580.00	\$18.50	\$17,186.50
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	929	\$50.00	\$46,450.00	\$50.00	\$46,450.00
9	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	9,290	\$3.50	\$32,515.00	\$2.25	\$20,902.50
10	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE	CY	370	\$155.00	\$57,350.00	\$142.00	\$52,540.00
11	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	280	\$55.00	\$15,400.00	\$103.00	\$28,840.00
12	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1 (448), PG 64-22	CY	325	\$175.00	\$56,875.00	\$182.00	\$59,150.00
13	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448) PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	195	\$175.00	\$34,125.00	\$155.00	\$30,225.00
14	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448) PG 64-22	CY	455	\$155.00	\$70,525.00	\$145.00	\$65,975.00
15	CONCRETE CURB RAMP	SF	100	\$30.00	\$3,000.00	\$30.00	\$3,000.00
16	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$1,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$615.00	\$3,075.00
17	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$450.00	\$900.00	\$450.00	\$900.00
18	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$2.75	\$2,750.00	\$1.85	\$1,850.00
19	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$50,000.00	\$50,000.00	\$55,000.00	\$55,000.00
20	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,150	\$4.00	\$4,600.00	\$8.00	\$9,200.00
21	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	195	\$70.00	\$13,650.00	\$62.00	\$12,090.00
22	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$875.00	\$875.00	\$610.00	\$610.00
23	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$29,270.00	\$29,270.00	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00
24	SIGNING, MISC.: SOLAR POWERED RECTANGULAR RAPID FLASHING BEACON(RRFB) SIGN ASSEMBLY	EACH	2	\$7,200.00	\$14,400.00	\$8,925.00	\$17,850.00
25	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$3,360.00	\$3,360.00
26	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$9,580.00	\$9,580.00
27	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	43	\$125.00	\$5,375.00	\$200.00	\$8,600.00
28	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY	LUMP	1	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00
29	INSPECTION ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00
30	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$587,579.00	TOTAL	\$593,632.00
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 80 DAYS		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 DAYS	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 8/10/2020		EARLIEST START DATE: 8/10/2020	

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	Karvo Companies, LLC		Precision Paving, Inc.	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REMOVED	SY	1,660	\$12.00	\$19,920.00	\$9.25	\$15,355.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	120	\$97.00	\$11,640.00	\$61.00	\$7,320.00
3	CONCRETE WALK REMOVED	SF	158	\$10.95	\$1,730.10	\$6.50	\$1,027.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	280	\$9.50	\$2,660.00	\$39.00	\$10,920.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	1,660	\$0.42	\$697.20	\$1.00	\$1,660.00
6	LINEAR GRADING	FT	5,170	\$8.25	\$42,652.50	\$10.50	\$54,285.00
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	929	\$15.00	\$13,935.00	\$23.00	\$21,367.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	929	\$74.00	\$68,746.00	\$72.00	\$66,888.00
9	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	9,290	\$3.00	\$27,870.00	\$1.90	\$17,651.00
10	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE	CY	370	\$145.00	\$53,650.00	\$142.00	\$52,540.00
11	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	280	\$63.00	\$17,640.00	\$49.00	\$13,720.00
12	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1 (448), PG 64-22	CY	325	\$183.00	\$59,475.00	\$196.00	\$63,700.00
13	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448) PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	195	\$145.00	\$28,275.00	\$195.00	\$38,025.00
14	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448) PG 64-22	CY	455	\$140.00	\$63,700.00	\$153.00	\$69,615.00
15	CONCRETE CURB RAMP	SF	100	\$28.25	\$2,825.00	\$42.00	\$4,200.00
16	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$587.50	\$2,937.50	\$925.00	\$4,625.00
17	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	2	\$424.95	\$849.90	\$525.00	\$1,050.00
18	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.75	\$1,750.00	\$1.25	\$1,250.00
19	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$45,000.00	\$45,000.00	\$36,000.00	\$36,000.00
20	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	1,150	\$7.00	\$8,050.00	\$18.00	\$20,700.00
21	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	195	\$62.00	\$12,090.00	\$74.00	\$14,430.00
22	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	1	\$579.50	\$579.50	\$575.00	\$575.00
23	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$17,500.00	\$17,500.00
24	SIGNING, MISC.: SOLAR POWERED RECTANGULAR RAPID FLASHING BEACON(RRFB) SIGN ASSEMBLY	EACH	2	\$7,450.00	\$14,900.00	\$7,500.00	\$15,000.00
25	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$4,800.00	\$4,800.00	\$2,500.00	\$2,500.00
26	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$18,250.00	\$18,250.00	\$10,000.00	\$10,000.00
27	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	43	\$185.00	\$7,955.00	\$165.00	\$7,095.00
28	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY	LUMP	1	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00	\$28,000.00
29	INSPECTION ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00	\$33,000.00
30	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$613,577.70	TOTAL	\$634,998.00
				NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 80 DAYS		NUMBER OF DAYS TO COMPLETE: 30 Days	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 8/10/2020		EARLIEST START DATE: 8/17/2020	

BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project – Phase 1 (3 Low Bidders)

Bid Opening Date – June 18, 2020

Avon, Ohio

Bid Components	Barbicas Construction Company, Inc.	Ronyak Paving, Inc.	Chagrin Valley Paving
Proposal - Completed and Signed	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond
Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Verification of Bid Total	Yes	Yes	Yes