



M E M O

To: **Ryan Cummins, P.E.**

From: Scott Wood, P.E.

Date: March 20, 2020

Project Number: 17325

Regarding: French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project
 Bid Results and Recommendation

Please find enclosed a Bid Tabulation for the bids received on March 19, 2020 for the French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project. A total of (8) bids were submitted and opened at the City of Avon – Avon Isle. Bids ranged from a low bid of \$1,072,719.75 to a high bid of \$1,417,668.50.

The Engineers Estimate for the project was \$1,405,045. The low bid of \$1,072,719.75 as received from Karvo Companies is approximately 23.6% below the Engineers Estimate for the project.

Summary of Bid Totals

Contractor	Bid Total
Karvo Companies	\$1,072,719.75
Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	\$1,186,395.75
Erie Blacktop, Inc.	\$1,202,230.50
Ronyak Paving	\$1,215,700.00
Barbicas Construction Company, Inc.	\$1,226,749.25
Kokosing Construction Company, Inc.	\$1,297,064.00
Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.	\$1,347,169.25
Precision Paving, Inc.	\$1,417,668.50

The bid as submitted by Karvo Companies has been reviewed and found to be in conformance with the requirements of the Contract Documents. Therefore, it is our recommendation to the City of Avon - City Council that Karvo Companies is the lowest and best bid for the French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project.

Cc: Michael Farmer, City of Avon, Service Director
 Bill Logan, City of Avon, Finance Director
 John Gasior, City of Avon, Law Director

BID TABULATION
FRENCH CREK ROAD PAVEMENT RESURFACING PROJECT
CITY OF AVON

DATE: MARCH 19, 2020

CVE JOB NO. 17325 Engineer's Estimate \$1,405,045

				Karvo Companies, Inc.		Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REMOVED	SY	3,355	\$5.90	\$19,794.50	\$10.00	\$33,550.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	200	\$60.00	\$12,000.00	\$110.00	\$22,000.00
3	CONCRETE WALK REMOVED	SF	929	\$3.00	\$2,787.00	\$3.00	\$2,787.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	560	\$5.00	\$2,800.00	\$7.00	\$3,920.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	3,355	\$0.40	\$1,342.00	\$0.25	\$838.75
6	LINEAR GRADING	FT	13,365	\$5.05	\$67,493.25	\$1.00	\$13,365.00
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$14.40	\$32,112.00	\$16.00	\$35,680.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$35.00	\$78,050.00	\$40.00	\$89,200.00
9	REMOVE AND REPLACE ASPHALT PATH	SY	40	\$38.00	\$1,520.00	\$140.00	\$5,600.00
10	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	22,280	\$2.45	\$54,586.00	\$3.50	\$77,980.00
11	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE	CY	745	\$122.00	\$90,890.00	\$130.00	\$96,850.00
12	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	560	\$52.00	\$29,120.00	\$50.00	\$28,000.00
13	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	775	\$161.00	\$124,775.00	\$175.00	\$135,625.00
14	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	465	\$149.00	\$69,285.00	\$175.00	\$81,375.00
15	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	1,090	\$123.00	\$134,070.00	\$140.00	\$152,600.00
16	CONCRETE CURB RAMP	SF	410	\$18.00	\$7,380.00	\$20.00	\$8,200.00
17	12 INCH STORM SEWER	LF	20	\$104.00	\$2,080.00	\$115.00	\$2,300.00
18	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	6	\$600.00	\$3,600.00	\$1,000.00	\$6,000.00
19	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$550.00	\$2,750.00	\$450.00	\$2,250.00
20	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.40	\$1,400.00	\$2.75	\$2,750.00
21	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$32,000.00	\$32,000.00	\$80,000.00	\$80,000.00
22	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	2,975	\$6.80	\$20,230.00	\$4.00	\$11,900.00
23	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	495	\$70.00	\$34,650.00	\$70.00	\$34,650.00
24	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	4	\$300.00	\$1,200.00	\$825.00	\$3,300.00
25	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$22,000.00	\$22,000.00	\$27,500.00	\$27,500.00
26	SIGNING, MISC.: SOLAR POWERED RECTANGULAR RAPID FLASHING BEACON (RRFB) SIGN ASSAMBLY	EACH	4	\$7,175.00	\$28,700.00	\$7,200.00	\$28,800.00
27	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00
28	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$11,750.00	\$11,750.00	\$20,000.00	\$20,000.00
29	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	83	\$185.00	\$15,355.00	\$125.00	\$10,375.00
30	ASPHALT BINDER PRICE ADJUSTMENT ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
31	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00
32	INSPECTION ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00
33	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$1,072,719.75	TOTAL	\$1,186,395.75
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 40		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 50	
				EARLIEST START DATE: Sept. 8, 2020		EARLIEST START DATE: Sept. 8, 2020	

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	Erie Blacktop Inc.		Ronyak Paving, Inc.	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REMOVED	SY	3,355	\$10.75	\$36,066.25	\$6.50	\$21,807.50
2	CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	200	\$95.00	\$19,000.00	\$65.00	\$13,000.00
3	CONCRETE WALK REMOVED	SF	929	\$5.00	\$4,645.00	\$2.50	\$2,322.50
4	EXCAVATION	CY	560	\$47.00	\$26,320.00	\$20.00	\$11,200.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	3,355	\$1.50	\$5,032.50	\$1.00	\$3,355.00
6	LINEAR GRADING	FT	13,365	\$2.20	\$29,403.00	\$8.00	\$106,920.00
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$17.00	\$37,910.00	\$30.00	\$66,900.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$48.00	\$107,040.00	\$50.00	\$111,500.00
9	REMOVE AND REPLACE ASPHALT PATH	SY	40	\$98.00	\$3,920.00	\$95.00	\$3,800.00
10	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	22,280	\$2.65	\$59,042.00	\$2.00	\$44,560.00
11	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE	CY	745	\$140.00	\$104,300.00	\$130.00	\$96,850.00
12	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	560	\$65.00	\$36,400.00	\$60.00	\$33,600.00
13	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	775	\$165.00	\$127,875.00	\$160.00	\$124,000.00
14	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	465	\$155.00	\$72,075.00	\$170.00	\$79,050.00
15	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	1,090	\$130.00	\$141,700.00	\$125.00	\$136,250.00
16	CONCRETE CURB RAMP	SF	410	\$18.50	\$7,585.00	\$16.00	\$6,560.00
17	12 INCH STORM SEWER	LF	20	\$140.00	\$2,800.00	\$155.00	\$3,100.00
18	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	6	\$610.00	\$3,660.00	\$675.00	\$4,050.00
19	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$435.00	\$2,175.00	\$525.00	\$2,625.00
20	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.85	\$1,850.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
21	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$75,000.00	\$75,000.00	\$46,000.00	\$46,000.00
22	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	2,975	\$7.15	\$21,271.25	\$6.00	\$17,850.00
23	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	495	\$57.00	\$28,215.00	\$85.00	\$42,075.00
24	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	4	\$540.00	\$2,160.00	\$550.00	\$2,200.00
25	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$8,000.00	\$8,000.00	\$19,825.00	\$19,825.00
26	SIGNING, MISC.: SOLAR POWERED RECTANGULAR RAPID FLASHING BEACON (RRFB) SIGN ASSAMBLY	EACH	4	\$8,715.00	\$34,860.00	\$1,500.00	\$6,000.00
27	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$3,360.00	\$3,360.00	\$2,750.00	\$2,750.00
28	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$18,750.00	\$18,750.00	\$22,450.00	\$22,450.00
29	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	83	\$178.50	\$14,815.50	\$200.00	\$16,600.00
30	ASPHALT BINDER PRICE ADJUSTMENT ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
31	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00
32	INSPECTION ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00
33	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$1,202,230.50	TOTAL	\$1,215,700.00
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 50		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 53 Days	
				EARLIEST START DATE: 9/8/20		EARLIEST START DATE: 9/8/2020	

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	Barbicas Paving, LLC		Kokosing Construction Company, Inc.	
				UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REMOVED	SY	3,355	\$10.00	\$33,550.00	\$14.00	\$46,970.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	200	\$75.00	\$15,000.00	\$13.00	\$2,600.00
3	CONCRETE WALK REMOVED	SF	929	\$5.00	\$4,645.00	\$2.50	\$2,322.50
4	EXCAVATION	CY	560	\$70.00	\$39,200.00	\$50.00	\$28,000.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	3,355	\$0.75	\$2,516.25	\$1.10	\$3,690.50
6	LINEAR GRADING	FT	13,365	\$0.30	\$4,009.50	\$7.00	\$93,555.00
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$18.00	\$40,140.00	\$20.00	\$44,600.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$40.45	\$90,203.50	\$45.00	\$100,350.00
9	REMOVE AND REPLACE ASPHALT PATH	SY	40	\$20.00	\$800.00	\$270.00	\$10,800.00
10	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	22,280	\$3.00	\$66,840.00	\$0.70	\$15,596.00
11	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE	CY	745	\$140.00	\$104,300.00	\$160.00	\$119,200.00
12	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	560	\$55.00	\$30,800.00	\$76.00	\$42,560.00
13	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	775	\$190.00	\$147,250.00	\$175.00	\$135,625.00
14	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	465	\$195.00	\$90,675.00	\$168.00	\$78,120.00
15	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	1,090	\$140.00	\$152,600.00	\$138.00	\$150,420.00
16	CONCRETE CURB RAMP	SF	410	\$15.00	\$6,150.00	\$16.00	\$6,560.00
17	12 INCH STORM SEWER	LF	20	\$70.00	\$1,400.00	\$155.00	\$3,100.00
18	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	6	\$995.00	\$5,970.00	\$675.00	\$4,050.00
19	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$250.00	\$1,250.00	\$525.00	\$2,625.00
20	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$1.25	\$1,250.00	\$1.50	\$1,500.00
21	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$75,000.00	\$75,000.00	\$72,950.00	\$72,950.00
22	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	2,975	\$8.00	\$23,800.00	\$8.00	\$23,800.00
23	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	495	\$50.00	\$24,750.00	\$78.00	\$38,610.00
24	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	4	\$300.00	\$1,200.00	\$550.00	\$2,200.00
25	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$35,000.00	\$35,000.00	\$40,000.00	\$40,000.00
26	SIGNING, MISC.: SOLAR POWERED RECTANGULAR RAPID FLASHING BEACON (RRFB) SIGN ASSAMBLY	EACH	4	\$8,000.00	\$32,000.00	\$8,300.00	\$33,200.00
27	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$2,000.00	\$2,000.00	\$1,200.00	\$1,200.00
28	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$15,000.00	\$15,000.00	\$11,750.00	\$11,750.00
29	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	83	\$150.00	\$12,450.00	\$170.00	\$14,110.00
30	ASPHALT BINDER PRICE ADJUSTMENT ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
31	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00
32	INSPECTION ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00
33	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
	TOTAL PROJECT COST			TOTAL	\$1,226,749.25	TOTAL	\$1,234,064.00
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 50 Days		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 61 Days	
				EARLIEST START DATE: September 8, 2020		EARLIEST START DATE: 9-1-20	

				Crossroads Asphalt Recycling, Inc.		Precision Paving, Inc.	
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE	UNIT PRICE	TOTAL PRICE
1	ASPHALT PAVEMENT REMOVED	SY	3,355	\$9.50	\$31,872.50	\$6.00	\$20,130.00
2	CONCRETE DRIVE REMOVAL AND ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPLACEMENT	SY	200	\$70.00	\$14,000.00	\$54.00	\$10,800.00
3	CONCRETE WALK REMOVED	SF	929	\$5.50	\$5,109.50	\$5.00	\$4,645.00
4	EXCAVATION	CY	560	\$40.00	\$22,400.00	\$38.00	\$21,280.00
5	SUBGRADE COMPACTION	SY	3,355	\$1.20	\$4,026.00	\$1.00	\$3,355.00
6	LINEAR GRADING	FT	13,365	\$3.25	\$43,436.25	\$9.00	\$120,285.00
7	ODOT 251 PARTIAL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$15.00	\$33,450.00	\$18.00	\$40,140.00
8	ODOT 253 FULL DEPTH ASPHALT PAVEMENT REPAIR	SY	2,230	\$48.00	\$107,040.00	\$65.00	\$144,950.00
9	REMOVE AND REPLACE ASPHALT PATH	SY	40	\$100.00	\$4,000.00	\$70.00	\$2,800.00
10	ODOT 254 PAVEMENT PLANING, ASPHALT CONCRETE & PORTLAND CEMENT CONCRETE	SY	22,280	\$3.50	\$77,980.00	\$2.20	\$49,016.00
11	ODOT 301 ASPHALT CONCRETE BASE	CY	745	\$150.00	\$111,750.00	\$148.00	\$110,260.00
12	ODOT 304 AGGREGATE BASE	CY	560	\$70.00	\$39,200.00	\$47.00	\$26,320.00
13	ASPHALT CONCRETE SURFACE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22	CY	775	\$185.00	\$143,375.00	\$188.00	\$145,700.00
14	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 1, (448), PG 64-22 (LEVELING COURSE)	CY	465	\$150.00	\$69,750.00	\$197.00	\$91,605.00
15	ASPHALT CONCRETE INTERMEDIATE COURSE, TYPE 2, (448), PG 64-22	CY	1,090	\$145.00	\$158,050.00	\$160.00	\$174,400.00
16	CONCRETE CURB RAMP	SF	410	\$22.00	\$9,020.00	\$34.00	\$13,940.00
17	12 INCH STORM SEWER	LF	20	\$125.00	\$2,500.00	\$80.00	\$1,600.00
18	MANHOLE ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	6	\$850.00	\$5,100.00	\$1,000.00	\$6,000.00
19	VALVE BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	5	\$400.00	\$2,000.00	\$425.00	\$2,125.00
20	MISCELLANEOUS METALS	LBS	1,000	\$2.00	\$2,000.00	\$1.25	\$1,250.00
21	MAINTENANCE OF TRAFFIC	LUMP	1	\$95,000.00	\$95,000.00	\$100,000.00	\$100,000.00
22	ODOT 617 SHOULDER PREPARATION	SY	2,975	\$10.00	\$29,750.00	\$7.50	\$22,312.50
23	ODOT 617 COMPACTED AGGREGATE	CY	495	\$68.00	\$33,660.00	\$74.00	\$36,630.00
24	MONUMENT BOX ADJUSTED TO GRADE	EACH	4	\$450.00	\$1,800.00	\$450.00	\$1,800.00
25	MOBILIZATION	LUMP	1	\$63,075.00	\$63,075.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
26	SIGNING, MISC.: SOLAR POWERED RECTANGULAR RAPID FLASHING BEACON (RRFB) SIGN ASSAMBLY	EACH	4	\$8,300.00	\$33,200.00	\$9,200.00	\$36,800.00
27	REMOVE AND REPLACE EXISTING LOOP DETECTORS	LUMP	1	\$3,200.00	\$3,200.00	\$3,500.00	\$3,500.00
28	PAVEMENT MARKINGS AND SIGNAGE	LUMP	1	\$17,825.00	\$17,825.00	\$19,500.00	\$19,500.00
29	MAILBOX SUPPORT SYSTEM	EACH	83	\$200.00	\$16,600.00	\$175.00	\$14,525.00
30	ASPHALT BINDER PRICE ADJUSTMENT ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00	\$25,000.00
31	GENERAL CONSTRUCTION CONTINGENCY ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00	\$63,000.00
32	INSPECTION ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00	\$74,000.00
33	CONSTRUCTION STAKING ALLOWANCE	LUMP	1	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00	\$5,000.00
TOTAL PROJECT COST				TOTAL	\$1,347,169.25	TOTAL	\$1,417,668.50
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 45 Days		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 40 Days	
				EARLIEST START DATE: Sept. 8, 2020		EARLIEST START DATE: 9/8/20	

BIDDER'S CHECKLIST

French Creek Road Pavement Resurfacing Project (3 Low Bidders)

Bid Opening Date – March 19, 2020

Avon, Ohio

Bid Components	Karvo Companies	Chagrin Valley Paving, Inc.	Erie Blacktop, Inc.
Proposal - Completed and Signed	Yes	Yes	Yes
Bid Bond or Check - Submitted with Bid	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond	Yes - Bid Bond
Bidder's Qualification Statement – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Personal Property Tax Statement – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Non-Collusion Affidavit – Completed with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Certifications for Finding of Recovery – Complete with Bid	Yes	Yes	Yes
Verification of Bid Total	Yes	Yes	Yes