



M E M O

22999 Forbes Road, Suite B • Cleveland, Ohio 44146-5667 • Phone: 440.439.1999 • Fax: 440.439.1969 • www.cvelimited.com

To: Mayor Bryan Jensen **EXHIBIT A**

From: Ryan E. Cummins, P.E.

Date: January 20, 2020

**Re: Avon Fire Department Fire Training Facility
Re-Bid Results and Recommendation**

**Cc: Frank Root, Fire Chief
Bill Logan, Finance Director
John Gasior, Law Director**

CVE Project Number: 19269

A summary showing the bid results from the January 9, 2020 public bid opening for the Avon Fire Department Fire Training Facility Project is provided below. The bid request was for the design, permitting, provision and installation of a Fire Training Facility via a design/build method of project delivery. The Engineer's Estimate for the project was \$345,000.00. The low bid of \$279,500.00 was received from American Fire Training Systems, Inc. and is approximately 19.0% below the Engineers Estimate for the project. A bid tabulation sheet is attached.

Bid Summary:

Contractor	Bid Total
American Fire Training Systems, Inc.	\$279,500.00
Janke and Sons Construction, Inc. dba WHP Trainingtowers	\$326,419.00
Kirila Fire Training Facilities, Inc.	\$378,915.00

Upon review, the bid as submitted by American Fire Training Systems, Inc. (AFTS) was found to be incomplete in the two ways: a) The Statement Regarding Personal Property Taxes (PPT-1) was not notarized; and b) the Certification Regarding Findings for Recovery (FR-1) was not completed. The Avon Law Director John Gasior was consulted, and it was his determination that those two items being incomplete could be deemed as immaterial to the bid at Avon's choosing. At the direction of Mr. Gasior, CVE staff then contacted AFTS on January 17, 2020 and the missing items were then supplied, in an acceptable manner, by AFTS later that same day.

The bid submitted by Janke and Sons Construction, Inc. dba WHP Trainingtowers (WHP) proposed a bid alternate titled "Alternate 1A Design & Construction of a modular structural steel fire training burn tower building per submitted specifications and drawings in lieu of "one trip" containers" with a bid of \$326,419.00.

Based upon the bids submitted and my review of those bids, it is my recommendation that the bid from American Fire Training Systems, Inc. be deemed the lowest and best.

BID TABULATION

Prepared by Chagrin Valley Engineering, Ltd.

**AVON FIRE DEPARTMENT FIRE TRAINING FACILITY
CITY OF AVON**

DATE: OCTOBER 24, 2019

CVE JOB NO.: 19269 ENGINEER'S ESTIMATE \$345,000.00

ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	AMERICAN FIRE TRAINING SYSTEMS, INC.	JAHNKE & SONS CONSTRUCTION, INC. DBA WHP TRAININGTOWERS	KIRILA FIRE TRAINING FACILITIES, INC.
				UNIT PRICE	UNIT PRICE	UNIT PRICE
1	DESIGN & CONSTRUCTION OF THE FIRE TRAINING BURN TOWER BUILDING	LUMP	1	\$398,915.00		\$378,915.00
	TOTAL PROJECT COST			\$398,915.00	\$0.00	\$378,915.00
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 210		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 120 ARO
				EARLIEST START DATE: Two weeks after notice to proceed		EARLIEST START DATE: Upon NTP (On or about January 31, 2020)
ITEM	DESCRIPTION	UNIT	QTY.	AMERICAN FIRE TRAINING SYSTEMS, INC.	JAHNKE & SONS CONSTRUCTION, INC. DBA WHP TRAININGTOWERS	KIRILA FIRE TRAINING FACILITIES, INC.
				UNIT PRICE	UNIT PRICE	UNIT PRICE
1A	DESIGN & CONSTRUCTION OF A MODULAR STRUCTURAL STEEL FIRE TRAINING BURN TOWER BUILDING PER SUBMITTED SPECIFICATIONS AND DRAWINGS IN LIEU OF "ONE TRIP" CONTAINERS	LUMP	1	\$326,419.00		
	TOTAL PROJECT COST			\$326,419.00	\$0.00	\$378,915.00
				DAYS TO COMPLETE: 240		DAYS TO COMPLETE: 120 ARO
				EARLIEST START DATE: January 31, 2020		EARLIEST START DATE: Upon NTP (On or about January 31, 2020)